

**HAWAI‘I COMMUNITY COLLEGE
UNIT ANNUAL REVIEW REPORT**

Apprenticeship Program

Date March 16, 2017

Review Period
July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2016

Initiator: Jessica Yamamoto
Writer(s): Richard T. Cowan

Program/Unit Review at Hawai‘i Community College is a shared governance responsibility related to strategic planning and quality assurance. Annual and 3-year Comprehensive Reviews are important planning tools for the College’s budget process. This ongoing systematic assessment process supports achievement of Program/Unit and Institutional Outcomes. Evaluated through a college-wide procedure, all completed Program/Unit Reviews are available to the College and community at large to enhance communication and public accountability. Please see <http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/files/program-unit-review/>

Please remember that this review should be written in a professional manner. Mahalo.

UNIT DESCRIPTION

Describe the Unit	
<p>Provide the short description as listed in the current catalog.</p>	<p>Hawaii Community College’s Apprenticeship Program is outlined in Hawaii’s Apprenticeship Law (Hawaii Revised Statutes 372-6 – Related instruction) where it states that the University of Hawaii Community Colleges are assigned with the related instructional responsibilities, or the classroom components for apprenticeship programs that are recognized and approved by the State of Hawaii’s Department of Labor and Industrial Relations (DLIR).</p> <p>The Apprenticeship Coordinator runs the program with oversight from the OCET director and support from the OCET staff that provide assistance with registration, purchasing, and hiring of instructors. The instructional faculty for apprenticeship is comprised of casual hires who are; regularly employed in a specific union trade; College faculty hired on an overload basis, or retired personnel who have the work skills and experience to train apprentices.</p> <p>Apprenticeship is a system of “learning while earning” and “learning by doing”. It combines on-the-job training with related and supplemental instruction provided by University of Hawaii Community Colleges. The apprenticeship system of training is distinctly unique where industry, education, and government are all active partners in this training endeavor.</p> <p>Each apprenticeship program is individualized by a specific trade or craft skill (carpenters, electricians, plumbers, sheet metal workers, etc).</p>
<p>Provide and discuss the unit’s mission (or goals and objectives if no unit mission statement is available).</p>	<p>The mission of Hawaii Community College’s Apprenticeship Program is to not only comply with the requirements of Hawaii’s Apprenticeship Law (Hawaii Revised Statutes 372-6 – Related instruction) that states: Related instruction for apprentices and training of teachers and coordinators for the instruction shall be the responsibility of the community colleges of the University of Hawaii system, but to also provide quality instruction and hands on training to the apprentices. Training is delivered in a professional manner by instructors regularly employed in a specific union trade, college faculty, or retired individuals who have the work skills and experience to train apprentices.</p>

Comprehensive Review information

Provide the year and URL for the location of this unit’s last Comprehensive Review on the HawCC Program/Unit Review website: http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/files/program-unit-review/	
Year	2014
URL	OCET - APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAM
Provide a short summary regarding the last Comprehensive Review for this unit. Discuss any significant changes to the unit since the last Comprehensive Review that are not discussed elsewhere in this review.	<p>The 3-yr. report was based on the period from July 1, 2010 to June 30, 2014. There were no major changes with the class programming system during this period. All apprenticeship classes were coordinated and offered based on the request(s) of a Sponsor.</p> <p>Since 2010 however, it was noted that there was a decline in the amount of classes offered compared to the previous 5 years of the program, during which the building industry was experiencing a construction “Boom”. This decline was a reflection of a reduction in training needs of the Sponsors, who recruit apprentices according to the demands of the workplace. During the 2010-2014 time period, the construction industry remained at a slow pace and unemployment rates remained relatively high.</p> <p>Given the past ten years, it is now known that the apprenticeship program has a very high tendency to expand or contract in direct relation to the ups and downs of the overall economy. This level of volatility is directly connected to the level of construction activities which generally fluctuate with the economy.</p> <p>There were no major changes made to program planning procedures during the 210-2014 period nor during the “boom years”, the system of class planning and implementation did not identify systematic problems to warrant procedural changes.</p> <p>Therefore, it is believed that the program planning system is able to accommodate large class and enrollment changes. However, the volume of classes to coordinate does becomes a workload concern as well as a budget concern due to the additional requirements for tools and materials to support the larger classes.</p>

QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS

ARPD Data

IF ARPD data is available for the unit, please attach a copy of the ARPD data and submit with the Unit Review document.

If no ARPD data is available for the unit, please provide and discuss relevant and/or comparable data as available from the unit's records.

a) **If you will be submitting the Unit Review document in hard copy, print and staple a copy of the ARPD data tables, if available, or other unit data as applicable, to the submission; the icon to print the ARPD data tables is on the upper right side, just above the data tables.**

OR

b) **If you will be submitting the Unit Review document in digital form, attach a PDF copy of the ARPD data tables, if available, or other unit data as applicable, along with the digital submission; the icon to download the ARPD data tables as a PDF is in the upper right side, just above the data tables.**

Unit ARPD data, if available, can be found on the ARPD website:

<http://www.hawaii.edu/offices/cc/arpd/>

ANALYSIS OF THE UNIT'S DATA

Describe, discuss, analyze, and provide context for the unit's data.

Discuss, analyze, and provide context for the unit's ARPD health scores in the Demand, Efficiency, Effectiveness, and Overall Health categories as applicable.

The Apprenticeship Program, while it is considered a college Unit, is in reality an instructional service provider. The program services those apprenticeship training programs that have been approved by the Apprenticeship Council, as outlined in the Hawaii Revised Statutes, Chapter 372 Apprenticeship Law.

In addition, student/apprentice enrollment, curriculum and coursework for the training classes provided at any of the University of Hawaii Community Colleges Apprenticeship Training Programs, are controlled by each of the individualized apprenticeship programs that are recognized by the State of Hawaii's Department of Labor and Industrial Relations (DLIR) and approved by the Apprenticeship Council. Therefore, the Apprenticeship Coordinators do not have the ability or the authority to increase enrollments, make changes to curriculum or develop additional course work to meet perceived increased needs within the community or related industries.

The Demand, Efficiency and Effectiveness indicators are not applicable to the Apprenticeship Training Program due to the simple fact that we do not control enrollment, student retention

	<p>and advancement to Journey person. This function is under the direction of each individual trade’s apprenticeship programs. Enrollment or indenture of apprentices is also controlled solely by each union trade or approved apprenticeship-training program. As an instructional service provider, the Community Colleges Apprenticeship Training Program ensures that the classroom and workshop spaces meet the requirements for each of the requested courses and that the necessary tools and equipment for “hands-on” instruction are in operable condition and up to date. The program coordinator also insures that the instructors are provided with up to date curriculum and materials for their coursework and that accurate attendance records are kept and that attendance reports and final grades sheets are submitted to each trades apprenticeship program coordinator.</p>
<p>Describe, discuss, analyze, and provide context for unit data that was collected based on its specific operations and functions. Examples could include, but are not limited to, work logs and activities records, meeting and session records, and any other relevant internal or external data, as appropriate.</p>	<p>NA</p>
<p>Describe any trends, and any internal and/or external factors that are relevant to understanding the unit’s activities during the review period.</p>	<p>There were no major changes made to program planning procedures during the AY2015-2016 period. However, there has been a recent increase in apprentice enrollment from the Fall 2016 semester to the Spring 2017 semester. This can be attributed to a more robust economy and the open enrollment for apprentices for the Carpenters Union on Hawaii Island that lead to an increase of indentured apprentices in the Hawaii Carpenters Apprenticeship and Training Fund. This equated to a 40% increase in enrollment in related carpentry training programs at Hawaii Community College. This increase in enrollment does become a workload concern as well as a budget concern due to the additional requirements for tools and materials to support the larger class sizes as well as available adequate workshop spaces for the “Hands on” courses. The current designated apprenticeship shop space is not adequate</p>

	for the increased class sizes and limits productivity for the apprentices as each student must wait for access to saws and tools in order to complete their weekly assignments for the “hands-on” portions of the course.
Discuss other strengths and challenges of the unit that are relevant to understanding the unit’s activities during the review period.	

Report and discuss all major/meaningful actions and activities that occurred in the unit during the review period. For example:	
Changes to the unit’s services, functions, and/or operations.	NA
Changes to the clients it serves (students, faculty, staff, community, UH System etc.).	NA
Personnel and position additions and/or losses.	The previous Apprenticeship Coordinator retired July 31 st , 2015 and Estee Nathanson, with the Office of Continuing Education and Training, acted as the interim Apprenticeship program coordinator until May 9 th , 2016 when the new Apprenticeship Coordinator, Richard T. Cowan started work.

<p>Other major/meaningful activities, including responses to previous CERC feedback, if applicable.</p>	
---	--

<p>Describe, analyze, and celebrate the unit’s successes and accomplishments. (For example, <i>more students were served OR the unit successfully integrated new strategies/technologies.</i>)</p>	
<p>Discuss what the unit has been doing well that needs to be maintained and strengthened.</p>	<p>The apprenticeship training program, with its emphasis on “learning while earning” and “learning by doing”, has continued a tradition of completing work projects for the Hawaii Community College Campus and several community work projects in Hilo and Kona. These have involved, at times, all of the apprenticeship trades and have ranged from re-tiling the apprenticeship bathroom in building 385A, building the Hawaii Community College’s front entry sign, erecting covered storage at the Masons’ apprenticeship yard and the carpentry shop, pouring new concrete driveways at Kealakehe High School and numerous smaller projects throughout the campus and community.</p> <p>The apprenticeship program has continued this tradition with several work projects that began late in the AY2015-2016, and will continue through the AY 2017-2017 such as; the plumbers and electrician apprentices repairing the kilns for the ceramics program, the carpentry apprentices building a new picnic table cover for a student picnic table area to be located on the north side of Hale Aloha and several work projects in coordination with the POM department. There is also a community work project for the St Josephs School driveway re-paving. The planning for this community project began in the beginning part of AY2016-2017 and will be a combined effort by the masons and carpenters apprentices.</p> <p>These types of Hawaii Community College and Community based apprenticeship work projects are an integral part of the program as they not only benefit and enhance the training for the apprentices but also fosters “good will” between the</p>

	related trades and their apprentices, the community college and the local community.
<p>Validate these successes by discussing positive improvements in the unit.</p> <p>Please provide evidence if applicable (ex: unit data reports, relevant URL links, etc.).</p>	<p>These types of work projects provide additional “learning by doing” educational opportunities for the apprentices where they can hone their knowledge and skills under the direct supervision of an instructor whom is able to provide immediate feedback and additional instruction throughout the work process. This type of “learning by doing” experience, coupled with focused instructional feedback, is not typically achieved in the high paced and task completion structure of the everyday union jobsite.</p> <p>While the typical “hands-on” class instruction consists of several carpentry projects that are structured to impart a specific set of skills, the work projects are, by their nature, not skill set specific and demand that the apprentices utilize all of their skills to complete the project and also promotes teamwork among the apprentices in order to complete the project.</p>

Describe, analyze, and discuss any challenges and/or obstacles the unit has faced.	
Identify and discuss the unit’s challenges/obstacles.	<p>The fundamental factor affecting the Hawaii Community College’s Apprenticeship program is the lack of adequate classroom and skills workshop spaces. This limitation is especially evident when enrollments increase due to a robust economy and greater demand for apprentices in the trade unions. In order to provide effective, quality and consistent training and education for the apprentices, as mandated by Hawaii’s Apprenticeship Law, we must be able to provide adequate classroom and shop spaces that can accommodate the cyclical upswings in enrollment.</p> <p>At the present time, the Hawaii Community College is limited in its ability to provide additional classroom and workshop space for the apprenticeship training program. However, there exist designated shop spaces and open work areas for the apprenticeship program but these spaces are currently under or inadequately utilized due to several factors. The primary being inadequate electrical supply to some of the</p>

	<p>shop spaces that restricts the use of power tools and professional training simulators. Additionally, some of the shop spaces are too small to accommodate the increased class sizes or the shop spaces are dilapidated with leaking roofs and are structurally compromised.</p>
<p>Discuss changes and actions taken to address those challenges.</p>	<p>In order to rectify this limitation to the apprenticeship training program, several modular containerized shop and classroom spaces have been designed that would help to better meet the needs of the program. These modular containerized buildings are temporary structures that can be assembled and disassembled/relocated as required and would be located in the designated apprenticeship open work sites. The construction of these temporary modular containerized shop and classroom spaces would be completed by the different apprenticeship programs and would provide invaluable “learn by doing” training as well as additional workshop and classroom spaces for the apprenticeship training program.</p>
<p>Describe and explain the results of these actions.</p>	<p>The modular containerized shop and classroom space plans and budgets have been presented to the administration for review and funding request. The goal would be to move forward with this work project in AY2016-2017.</p>
<p>Discuss what still needs to be done in order to successfully meet and overcome these challenges.</p>	

UNIT ACTION PLAN

Discuss the unit's prior year's (AY14-15) action plan and results.	
<p>Describe the unit's action plan from the prior review period and discuss how it was implemented in AY15-16.</p> <hr/>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Develop an Apprenticeship Advisory Committee to allow the Coordinator to work with different sectors to develop new apprenticeship programs. 2. Research the feasibility of transferring the Apprenticeship Program from the Kealakehe High School campus to the Palamanui campus 3. The Apprenticeship Program will work with the Assessment Coordinator to create measurable unit outcomes much like the OCET unit has. <hr/>
<p>Discuss the results of the action plan and the unit's success in achieving its goals.</p> <hr/>	<p>An Apprenticeship Advisory Committee was not formed in the AY15-16 as the program was being overseen temporarily by OCET staff during the transition period between the retirement of the former apprenticeship program coordinator and the hiring of a new program coordinator whom started in May 2016.</p> <p>Furthermore, The University of Hawaii's Community Colleges are assigned with the related instructional responsibilities, or the classroom components of these programs as outlined in Hawaii's Apprenticeship Law (Hawaii Revised Statutes 372-6 – Related instruction). Therefore, developing “an Apprenticeship Advisory Committee to allow the Coordinator to work with different sectors to develop new apprenticeship programs”, would not only be stepping outside of the instructional responsibilities set forth by the States Apprenticeship Law but would also be impractical as the primary requirement for any apprenticeship program is the sponsorship by an employer or employers' association, where the standards, collective bargaining agreement, or other instrument provide for participation by a union in any matter in the operation of the apprenticeship program. The primary drivers of any apprenticeship program are industry, businesses and unions.</p>

However, there has been participation by the new program coordinator with the Hawaii County Workforce Development Board where an overview of the existing apprenticeship programs was presented and information provided on the requirements and approval process for developing new apprenticeship programs.

The role of the program coordinator for apprenticeship training is that of managing and supporting the educational component for approved existing apprenticeships.

However, the apprenticeship coordinator could also provide support to the Hawaii County Workforce Development Board by providing information, on the support the Community Colleges provide to all approved apprenticeship programs, to larger community and government groups and employers or employers' associations that are interested in developing and applying for approval of a new apprenticeship program.

The **feasibility of transferring the Apprenticeship Program from the Kealakehe High School campus to the Palamanui campus** was not addressed in the AY15-16 but is currently being addressed in AY16-17. Discussions and planning sessions were conducted with the Director of the Palamanui Campus, Marty Fletcher and the landscape consultant Calley O'Nielle. It was determined that the best course of action, due to the limited classroom space and non-existent shop spaces on the Palamanui campus, would be to design temporary modular containerized shop and classroom spaces for the apprenticeship programs. The designs were developed by the apprenticeship program coordinator Richard Cowan and reviewed by Marty Fletcher and Calley O'Nielle. Three containerized design concepts were agreed upon by the team and the material budgets for each design were calculated and presented.

The containerized shop and class spaces would be erected by the cooperative effort of the different trade union apprentices and would not only provide real world and hands on training but also provide new shop and classroom

	<p>spaces at the Palamanui Campus. The plans and proposals have been submitted to the Chancellors' office which was then put forth as part of a legislative budget request for Palamanui.</p> <p>Work with the Assessment Coordinator to create measurable unit outcomes much like the OCET unit has.</p> <p>This action plan was not addressed during the AY15-16 due to the apprenticeship-training program being overseen by the OCET staff during the transition period between the retirement of the former apprenticeship program coordinator and the hiring of a new program coordinator whom started in May 2016. However, the new program coordinator has been in discussion the assessment coordinator and will work on developing measurable unit outcomes that are appropriate for the apprenticeship training programs unique structure.</p>
<p>Discuss any challenges the unit had in implementing that action plan or achieving its goals.</p>	<p>The primary limitations to the implementation of the action plan for AY15-16 was that there was no apprenticeship program coordinator for most of the 2015-2016 Academic year.</p>

- Did the unit review its website during AY15-16? Please check the box below that applies.

Reviewed website, no changes needed.

Reviewed website and submitted change request to webmaster on _____(date)_____.

Reviewed website and will submit change request to webmaster.

X Unit does not have a website.

NOTE: Apprenticeship should have a website that is tied with OCET in order to continue community outreach and provide a space to further promote and highlight activities.

Please note that requests for revisions to unit websites must be submitted directly to the College's webmaster at

<http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/web-developer>

<p>Discuss the unit's overall action plan for AY16-17, based on analysis of the unit's data and the overall results of unit outcomes assessments conducted during AY15-16.</p>	<p>Benchmarks and Timelines for implementation and achievement of goals.</p>
<p>Action Goal 1: Work with the existing and new apprenticeship instructors to assess the current instructional materials, guidelines and codes of conduct, shop space and work area rules and class attendance and participation requirements for the apprentices so the we can determine where changes, improvements and enhancements are required in order further enhance the training programs for the apprenticeship trades in order to insure that we are providing the best quality instruction.</p>	<p>Benchmarks/Timelines: Complete review by the end of the Spring AY 2016-2017 semester. Make revisions and additions as noted in the review and begin implementation in Fall AY2016-2017 semester.</p>
<p>How can this Action Goal lead to improvements in unit services, functions, or operations, and support attainment of the unit's outcomes (UOs)? This action will allow the program coordinator to develop new and revised existing procedures for the apprenticeship training in conjunction with the feedback and input of the apprenticeship instructors.</p>	
<p>Action Goal 2: Work on Improving the training facilities, tools and equipment at the Manono campus in order to better serve and train the apprentices.</p>	<p>Benchmarks/Timelines: Complete upgrades by the beginning of Spring 2017-2018 semester.</p>
<p>How can this Action Goal lead to improvements in unit services, functions, or operations, and support attainment of the unit's outcomes (UOs)? In order to provide the best training possible to the apprentices we must ensure that the facilities are update and the tools required for each work project are in proper working order and of proper quality for the given training tasks.</p>	

<p>Action Goal 3: Relocate the apprenticeship training facilities on the west side, currently located at the Kealakehe High School, to new facilities on the Palamanui Campus.</p>	<p>Benchmarks/Timelines: Dependant on funding but goal would be Fall AY2016-2017 semester.</p>
<p>How can this Action Goal lead to improvements in unit services, functions, or operations, and support attainment of the unit’s outcomes (UOs)?</p> <p>By relocating the apprenticeship training programs on the West side of Hawaii Island to the Palamanui campus we will be able to better serve the apprentices by providing workshop and classroom spaces that are specific to the apprenticeship training program with the required tools, equipment and classrooms consolidated into one location, with the exemption of the Konawaena shop space, so that the instructors will have the instructional tools, materials and resources centralized and be better able to work cooperatively with each other which will allow for greater continuity to the program and provide consistent and more professional instruction for the apprentices.</p>	

RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS

NOTE: General budget asks are included in the 3-year Comprehensive Review. Budget asks for the following categories only may be included in the Annual review: health and safety needs, emergency needs, and/or necessary needs to become compliant with Federal/State laws/regulations.

Please provide a brief statement about any implications of or challenges with the unit’s current operating resources.

For budget asks in the allowed categories (see above):	
Describe the needed item(s) in detail.	<p>The current training area for the Masons Apprenticeship Training Program is in disrepair with rusted roofing, rotted and termite damaged rafters and continual leak issues in areas where power tools are utilized as part of the training program. This poses a real health and safety issue for the apprentices and instructors.</p> <p>The training area requires new rafters, perlings and metal roofing in order to resolve these safety issues.</p> <p>In addition, the current apprenticeship workshop for the Plumbers and Pipe Fitters Apprenticeship Training, located in building 392 bay 5, lacks adequate electrical service. This severely limits the training capabilities for the apprentices as there is not enough electrical power or outlets for the use of tools and training simulators for the “hands-on” instruction. In order to better serve the apprentices and provide greater use of power tools and training simulators to the instructor, a complete electrical upgrade is required.</p> <p>The final limitation, and one that has been previously addressed, is the limited shop and classroom spaces for the apprenticeship training program. Primarily for the Carpenters Apprenticeship program. The addition of the modular containerized workshops and classroom spaces will help rectify this situation and provide the needed additional workshop and classroom spaces.</p>
Include estimated cost(s) and timeline(s) for procurement.	<p>Masons’ Workshop Space; Trusses and New Metal Roof Materials: \$12,650.00 Labor: To be provided by apprentices as work project.</p> <p>Plumbers and Pipe Fitters Shop Space; Electrical upgrade. Materials: \$9,860.00 Labor: Provided by the apprentices</p> <p>Carpentry Additional Shop Space; Modular Containerized Shop and Classroom Space. Materials: \$16,567.00 Labor: Provided by the apprentices</p> <p>Desk Upgrades for the Carpentry Classrooms Estimate: \$8,456.00</p>
Explain how the item(s) aligns	

with one or more of the strategic initiatives of <u>2015-2021 Strategic Directions</u> .	
--	--

<http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/sites/default/files/docs/strategic-plan/hawcc-strategic-directions-2015-2021.pdf>

UNIT OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT

For all parts of this section, please provide information based on unit outcomes (UO) assessments conducted in AY 2015-16.

Unit Outcomes Assessed

- List all unit outcomes assessed during AY 2015-16.

Assessed Unit Outcome #	Unit Outcome Text
	Unit did not conduct assessments in AY2015-2016 as there was no program coordinator until May 2016. However, now that the new program coordinator has been hired he we will be working on developing an assessment plan that is suited for the unique structure of the Apprenticeship Training Program.

Assessment Strategies

For each UO assessed in AY 2015-16 listed above, provide a brief description of the assessment strategy, including:	
a description of the type of <u>unit work or activity assessed</u> , including unit service records, client satisfaction surveys, and other types of assessment instruments.	

a description of <u>who conducted the assessment</u> , (e.g., an individual unit faculty/staff member, <u>OR</u> a group of unit faculty/staff).	
a discussion of the <u>assessment rubric/scoring guide</u> that identifies criteria/categories and standards used in the assessment.	

Expected Levels of Achievement

- For each unit outcome (UO) assessed in AY 2015-16, indicate the benchmark goal for unit success.
 - example 1: “85% of students surveyed will rate the unit’s services as meeting or exceeding their expectation”;
 - example 2: “95% of service requests will be completed on time and to the satisfaction of the requester.”

Assessed UO#	Benchmark Goal for Unit Success for Each UO Assessed

Results of Unit Assessments

For each UO assessed in AY 2015-16:	
provide a <u>description of the assessment results</u> in terms of unit’s attainment of the UOs.	NA

--	--

Other Comments

Include any additional information that will help clarify the unit's UO assessment results.	
Include comparisons to any applicable College or related UH-System service-unit standards, or to any national standards from industry, professional organizations, or accrediting associations, as applicable.	NA

Next Steps – Assessment Action Plan

Describe the unit's intended next steps to improve assessment of the UOs based on the unit's overall AY 2015-16 assessment results. Include any specific strategies, tactics, activities, or plans for revisions to assessment practices, and/or service or operational change, or increased student support:	
Changes to assessment practices, activities, or projects.	
Modifications to the unit's services, functions, operations, client relations, and/or faculty/staff professional development activities over the next 3 years.	
Increases or changes in student support activities and services to support student learning and achievement.	