

HAWAI‘I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL PROGRAM REVIEW (APR)

Culinary Arts – East Hawai‘i

Date: April 2, 2019

**Review Period
July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018**

Initiator: Anne Chung
Writer(s): Brian Hirata

Program/Unit Review at Hawai‘i Community College is a shared governance responsibility related to strategic planning and quality assurance. Annual and 3-year Comprehensive Reviews are important planning tools for the College’s budget process. This ongoing systematic assessment process supports achievement of Program/Unit and Institutional Outcomes. Evaluated through a college-wide procedure, all completed Program/Unit Reviews are available to the College and community at large to enhance communication and public accountability. Please see <http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/files/program-unit-review/>

Please remember that this review should be written in a professional manner. Mahalo.

PART 1: PROGRAM DATA AND ACTIVITIES

Program Description (required by UH System)

Provide the short description as listed in the current catalog.	This program is designed to provide for entry-level employment in hotels, full-service restaurants, fast food restaurants, institutions (schools, hospitals, corrections, etc.) and private clubs. Accredited by the American Culinary Federation since July 2005.
---	--

Comprehensive Review information (required by UH System)

Provide the year and URL for the location of this program's last Comprehensive Review on the HawCC Program/Unit Review website: http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/files/program-unit-review/	
Year	2015
URL	http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/files/program-unit-review/docs/2015_culn-eh_comprehensive_program_review.pdf
<p>Provide a short summary of the CERC's evaluation and recommendations from the program's last Comprehensive Review.</p> <p>Discuss any significant changes to the program that were aligned with those recommendations but are not discussed elsewhere in this report.</p>	<p>The CERC's comments to the program's 2015 Comprehensive Program Review included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overall, generally well done • Provided good detailed discussions of its successes and of most of its core activities. • Difficult to distinguish the Hilo program from the West Hawaii program in this report. • The review needed to provide better consideration of the program's challenges and a much stronger and detailed action plan to address those challenges. • The review lacked any discussion of the program's overall assessment data for the 3-year period, which seriously weakens the report. <p>Program's responses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Need to find a solution to separate East Hawaii and Pāalamanui's data. This separation will allow an accurate analysis of program data. • A more aggressive approach to assessment has been employed in order to comply with 5-year assessment schedule.

ARPD Data: Analysis of Quantitative Indicators (required by UH System)

Program data can be found on the ARPD website: <http://www.hawaii.edu/offices/cc/arpd/>

**Please attach a copy of the program's data tables
and submit with this Annual Program Review (APR).**

Analyze the program's ARPD data for the review period. Describe, discuss, and provide context for the data, including the program's health scores in the following categories:	
Demand	<p>New and Replacement Positions for the State and County went down slightly from AY16-17. A 4% decline for the State was indicated and 6% decline for the County. This was an unforeseen trend as the State's unemployment rate was very low during this period at 2%. With the unemployment rate low and with the upturn in the economy, the program has finally experienced a drop in enrollment this past year. Despite the drop in Majors, the program has maintained its Fall Full-Time number of enrolled students and has increased its Spring Full-Time enrollment from 83% to 92%. Demand indicators for AY 17-18 remain Healthy.</p>
Efficiency	<p>The program increased its Fill Rate by 4.7% (66.3% to 71.0%) from the previous academic year. I believe that the FTE BOR Appointed Faculty number is inaccurate as we have 4 Full Time Faculty within the program (2 at Pālanui and 2 in East Hawaii).</p> <p>The program maintains its Healthy Efficiency rating. This can be contributed to the low number of FTE Faculty within the program and maintaining a healthy enrollment rate amidst the State's economic upturn.</p>
Effectiveness	<p>Effectiveness indicators remain Healthy. Successful Completion measures were maintained from the previous year at 83%. The program was pleased to see an increase in Persistence Fall to Spring and a 10% increase in Persistence Fall to Fall. New strategies and learning tools were implemented in many of the program's courses during this time, and it is suspected that this was a factor for the success this past year.</p> <p>Withdrawals increased from the previous year (18 to 32). The Culinary Program does not necessarily view withdrawals as a negative as program faculty and counselors are used to assist students in identifying appropriate program and career paths that suit the needs and strengths of the individual student.</p>

Overall Health	Healthy
Distance Education	N/A
Perkins Core Indicators (if applicable)	<p>1P1 Not Met. The Culinary Program may need to create some type of entrance exam into the program. Instructors have also found that many of our students enter the program not being college ready or prepared for the rigor of this program.</p> <p>3P1 Not Met. A very large percentage of our students view the culinary degree as terminal. Upon completion, most students enter the workforce. Our retention is not a teaching performance issue, rather a realistic approach on students choosing an appropriate career path.</p> <p>4P1 Not Met. Despite the record low unemployment rate in the State and many positions available on the State and County level, this past year’s cohort has seen a large percentage of graduates choosing not to enter the workforce immediately. The program will need to take a hard look at this phenomenon in order to determine whether this is a one-time occurrence, or if this is an indication of the changing needs of the graduates.</p>
Performance Funding Indicators (if applicable)	The number of Degrees and Certificates has fallen from 51 in AY 16-17 to 35 in AY 17-18. This falls in line with the drop in enrollment for the program and college. With this drop in enrollment, there subsequently was also a drop in Degrees and Certificates Native Hawaiian. The program recently created a social media site using modern technology in order to market the program to a broader audience and potentially increase enrollment.
What else is relevant to understanding the program’s data? Describe any trends, internal/external factors, strengths and/or challenge that can help the reader understand the	<p>Our strong industry demand has assisted in maintaining our healthy enrolment.</p> <p>There appears to be a shift in the current student generation and what they value as being important factors for education and career. Many graduates have chosen to not enter the workforce in traditional food service careers (ex. Luxury resorts, hotels, and institutions) and opting for smaller boutique restaurants, and entrepreneurship endeavors such as food trucks, private chef, and private patisserie contracts. Students working in these types of food niches are difficult to measure with the current method of tracking graduates of the program, and also decreases the accuracy of the data provided. The program</p>

program's data but are not discussed above.	has been using social media, and one-to-one communication with the graduates in order to better track and measure their performance in the industry.
---	--

PROGRAM ACTIVITIES

Report and discuss all major actions and activities that occurred in the program during the review period, including the program's meaningful accomplishments and successes. Also discuss the challenges or obstacles the program faced in supporting student success and explain what the program did to address those challenges.

For example, discuss:

- Changes to the program's curriculum due to course additions, deletions, modifications (CRC, Fast Track, GE-designations), and re-sequencing;
 - New certificates/degrees;
 - Personnel and/or position additions and/or losses;
 - Other changes to the program's operations or services to students.
- Course modification for CULN 130 (Intermediate Cookery). Course name, number, and description change to CULN 133 (Bistro Cookery and Intro to Dining Room Service). New competencies were added to the existing competencies.
 - Decrease of 1 credit to CULN 220 (Advanced Cookery). This modification was done in order to align with the other culinary programs "Advanced Cookery" course which holds a 5 credit load.
 - Completion and submission of Program Self-Study to American Culinary Federation (Accreditation body). Site visit to occur in April 2019.

PROGRAM WEBSITE

Has the program recently reviewed its website? Please check the box below that best applies and follow through as needed to keep the program's website up-to-date.

Program faculty/staff have reviewed the website in the past six months, no changes needed.

Program faculty/staff reviewed the website in the past six months and submitted a change request to the College's webmaster on 12/17/18 (date).

Program faculty/staff recently reviewed the website as a part of the annual program review process, found that revisions are needed, and will submit a change request to College's webmaster in a timely manner.

Please note that requests for revisions to program websites must be submitted directly to the College's webmaster at <http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/web-developer>

PART 2: PROGRAM ACTION PLAN

AY18-19 ACTION PLAN

Provide a detailed narrative discussion of the program's overall action plan for AY18-19, based on analysis of the Program's AY17-18 data and the overall results of course learning outcomes assessments conducted during the AY17-18 review period.

This Action Plan should identify the program's specific goals and objectives for AY18-19 and must provide benchmarks or timelines for achieving each goal.

- 1) New Advisory Council created last year offered suggestions on course CLO's. The program is making plans to modify some of the Program's CLO's for clarity and to provide better assessment strategies. Modifications to CLO's to occur by the end of Fall 2019.
- 2) Continued strengthening and progression between the Agriculture program and Culinary program. Recently acquired agricultural space for the Agriculture program will allow further planning and collaborative educational opportunities for the two programs. Plans to integrate small animal husbandry to the Agricultural program and further food production and education for the Culinary program is in the planning process. Timeline for integration will be contingent on completion of infrastructure and funding for small animal husbandry competencies.
- 3) Lower retention of students may not indicate a lack of performance but rather a realistic approach to helping students identify the appropriate career choice for themselves. Although the program has adopted this philosophy, discussions among the instructors are occurring in order to find solutions to decrease the number of non-persistence for the program.

ACTION ITEMS TO ACCOMPLISH ACTION PLAN

For each Action Item below, describe the strategies, tactics, initiatives, innovations, activities, etc., that the program plans to implement in order to accomplish the goals described in the Action Plan above.

For each Action Item below, discuss how implementing this action will help lead to improvements in student learning and their attainment of the program’s learning outcomes (PLOs).

Action Item 1:

The program is working with the college’s Assessment Coordinator to make modifications to the CLO’s to provide clarity and offer better assessment strategies. Improved CLO’s will better align to PLO’s and offer better assessment opportunities for increased student learning outcomes.

Action Item 2:

This innovative approach to our local food systems will offer students a very unique learning experience. By integrating small animal husbandry into the Agriculture program and allowing the Culinary students the opportunity to participate in a closed “food cycle” will enhance their learning of this very import and critical topic. This collaborative effort aligns with PLO6 “Choose an appropriate career path based on industry knowledge or requirements.” and PLO9 “Integrate their knowledge of Hawaii’s culture and food into cuisine.”

Action Item 3:

Plans to discuss options and solutions with administration will be implemented. Lowering non-persistence for the program will translate into improvements in the students learning.

RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS

NOTE: General “budget asks” are included in the 3-year Comprehensive Review. Budget asks for the following three categories only may be included in the APR: 1) health and safety needs, 2) emergency needs, and/or 3) necessary needs to become compliant with Federal/State laws/regulations.

BUDGET ASKS

For budget ask in the allowed categories (see above):	
Describe the needed item(s) in detail.	HEALTH -SAFETY Addition of a new boiler or “hot water on demand” for facilities hot water capabilities. Currently, the program is running on its last boiler. Other broken boilers in facility were deemed “unrepairable” due to age of boilers and the

	unavailability of parts. Loss of the last working boiler will result in the “shut down” of the facility by Board of Health standards.
Include estimated cost(s) and timeline(s) for procurement.	Estimated cost is held in Program office.
<p>Explain how the item(s) aligns with one or more of the strategic initiatives of <u>2015-2021 Strategic Directions</u>:</p> <p>http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/sites/default/files/docs/strategic-plan/hawcc-strategic-directions-2015-2021.pdf</p>	<p>These budget ask aligns with:</p> <p>21st Century Facilities (21CF) - Modern Teaching and Learning Environments</p> <p>Goal: Eliminate the university’s deferred maintenance backlog and modernize facilities and campus environments to be safe, sustainable, and supportive of modern practices in teaching, learning, and research.</p> <p>21CF Action Strategy 1: Adopt model policies and practices for development and management of UH buildings and campuses.</p> <p>Tactics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support and work with UH System to advocate for Hawai‘i CC and Hawai‘i CC-Pāalamanui facility needs. • Seek external opportunities and grants that will provide new construction and renovation funding, i.e., Title III Renovation Grants <p>21CF Action Strategy 3: Provide safe, healthy, and discrimination-free environments for teaching, learning, and scholarship for students, employees, and visitors.</p> <p>Tactics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update system-wide and campus policies and guidelines to ensure compliance and promote safety and security. • Participate in the Modern Facilities Task Force.

PART 3: LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENTS

For all parts of this section, please provide information based on CLO (course learning outcomes) or PLO (program learning outcomes) assessments conducted in AY17-18.

Evidence of Industry Validation and Participation in Assessment (for CTE programs only)

Provide documentation that the program has submitted evidence and achieved certification or accreditation (if applicable) from an organization granting certification/accreditation in the program's industry/profession. If the program/degree/certificate does not have a certifying body, you must submit evidence of the program's advisory committee's/board's recommendations for, approval of, and/or participation in the program's assessment(s).

Please attach copy of industry validation for the year under review.



January 13, 2015

Hawaii Community College Hilo Campus
200 W Kawili St
Hilo, HI 96720-4075

Attn: Culinary Arts Department

Dear Sir or Madam,

Congratulations! The American Culinary Federation Education Foundation's (ACFEF) Accrediting Commission recently met and approved your request for Renewal accreditation. The Commission has given a **Grant of Accreditation** beginning 06/30/2014 not to exceed beyond **6/30/2019**, for the following program:

Culinary Arts Associate of Applied Science

Your certificate is enclosed. We hope you display it with pride.

As part of the continual monitoring of your program by the Accrediting Commission, you will have an **Annual Report due to the ACF national office by 11/14/2015**. An electronic template will be sent to you with additional information at least three months prior to your Annual Report due date.

For your announcements and/or publications, it is important that whoever reads your publications understands that the accreditation is programmatic and that your program is accredited by the Accrediting Commission. Please ensure that the wording specifies that your program is "accredited by the Accrediting Commission of the American Culinary Federation Education Foundation" or "accredited by the American Culinary Federation Education Foundation's Accrediting Commission".

Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact the accreditation department, at 800-624-9458.

Best wishes for continued success during your upcoming academic year.

Congratulations,

Christopher A. Koetke, CEC, CCE, MBA, HAAC
Chair, ACFEF Accrediting Commission

cc: file

180 Center Place Way • St. Augustine, Florida 32095
(800) 624.9458 • Fax: (904) 825.4758 • acf@acfcchefs.net • www.acfcchefs.org

Courses Assessed

List all program courses assessed during AY17-18, including Initial and “Closing the Loop” assessments.			
Assessed Course Alpha, No., & Title	Semester assessed	CLOs assessed (CLO#s)	PLO alignment (PLO#s)
CULN 270 Food and Beverage Cost Control	Fall 2017	1. Analyze, identify, and apply the use of best practices with green friendly products and equipment.	3, 4
		2. Demonstrate proper procedures to ensure food sustainability with wastes and paper products to benefit the cost of an establishment.	3, 4
		3. Analyze the mathematical and logical statements while demonstrating cost control techniques in the lab to explain the importance of budgeting in the business world.	4
“Closing the Loop” Assessed Course Alpha, No., & Title	Semester assessed	CLOs assessed (CLO#s)	PLO alignment (PLO#s)
CULN 130 Intermediate Cookery	Fall 2017	1 Develop skills in knife, tool and equipment handling and apply principles of food preparation to produce a variety of food products.	2, 5, 7, 8, 9
		2 Practice standards in behavior, grooming and dress that reflect the mature work attitude expected of industry professionals.	2, 5, 7, 8, 9
		3 Apply the experience of service-learning to both personal and academic development by becoming involved in community service activities.	2, 7, 8, 9
		4 Identify and employ the use of standardized recipes, measurements,	2, 5, 7, 8, 9

		portion control procedures, and basic food costing.	
--	--	---	--

Assessment Strategies

For each course assessed in AY17-18 listed above, provide a brief description of the assessment strategy, including:

- a description of the type of student work or activity assessed (e.g., research paper, lab report, hula performance, etc.);
- a description of how student artefacts were selected for assessment (e.g., the assessment included summative assignments from all students in the course, OR a sample of students' summative assignments was randomly selected for assessment based on a representative percentage of students in each section of the course);
- a brief discussion of the assessment rubric/scoring guide and the criteria/categories and standards used in the assessment.

Course Alpha/#: CULN 270

The final exam for this course was chosen for assessment. The entire cohort was measured. The final exam contained question and answer, multiple choice, and short essays measuring topics aligned to the CLO's.

Type of student work to be assessed: Final Exam

How will conduct the assessment? Course instructor and other culinary faculty.

Work of all the students in the course will be assessed on the final.

Below is a description of what the course covers.

CLO 3 - Cost control is necessary for a profitable restaurant operation. A successful, talented food service manager is faced with a variety of responsibilities, accounting, marketing, human relations, facilities maintenance, legal issues, sanitation, production and service methods to name a few. Cost control techniques covered in class with math teams, costing worksheets and lab yield% demos for butchered and cooked; fish, chicken, beef. Understanding the importance of cost control and budgeting, students are able to cost three different recipes. Along with an understanding of fixed and variable costs.

CLO 1 & 2 - This semester we added a new category "Green and Growing" recognizing the environment consciousness customers recognize and are asking the industry to adopt practices and policies. Learning how to grow a business by implementing earth-friendly business practices that are specific to the hospitality industry.

With Power Points on topics such as Farm to Table, Carbon Footprint, Recycling, and Conserving Energy. A few questions on tests, the topic was challenging, to get the students excited about this topic.

In the spring of 2017, the class had a field trip to the Hawaii Community College Agriculture Green Houses. The culinary department also received fresh produce from the Agriculture department though the semester to utilize in the kitchen. This activity excited the students, in seeing how the food was grown and using fresh and unique ingredients in our dishes. Two of our students that graduated last year are taking Agriculture classes this semester to expand their knowledge.

With this positive experience, we had our field trip in the fall. That follows the ‘Green and Growing’ theme. In addition to a Power Point, there is a vocabulary “Green Restaurant Option” that includes a one-page paper written on a topic they select. Mid Term & Final has questions and short essays.

Working on Kahoot to increase learning about the topic and making it entrusting and challenging.

Course Alpha/#: CULN 130

CLOs 1,2, and 4 will be assessed using the student’s Daily Lab Performance rubric. This will be a practicum based assessment.

Students are assessed on a daily basis within the kitchen labs. A standardized menu will be used to facilitate the course topics and used as a tool for measuring performance.

For CLO’s 1, 2, and 4, a Daily Lab Performance rubric was used. Criteria included: Personal Hygiene and appearance (professional appearance), Sanitation and Station order, Correct skills and technique, Correct mise en place, Production and focus, and Team Player Leadership skills. A 0-4 point system was used for each criteria, 4 points denoting a “High Grade”, 1 point for “Not Apparent”, and 0 points for being absent.

Half of the cohort will be randomly chosen and assessed on the final two weeks of instruction.

The assessment period will cover 9 lab days (4 hours each day) per student.

The two instructors for this course will gather data from the Daily Lab Performance rubric and compile the results.

For CLO 3, the Taste of Hilo was chosen as a service-learning project. Instructors for this course observed the student performance during this public event.

Expected Levels of Achievement

For each course assessed in AY17-18 listed above, state the standard (benchmark, goal) for student success for each CLO assessed AND the percentage of students expected to meet that standard for each CLO.

Example: "CLO#1: The standard for student success is that students will answer 80% of the questions on the final exam related to CLO#1 correctly. The expectation is that 85% of students will meet this standard for CLO#1."

Example: "CLO#4: The standard for student success is that students will be able to perform skills associated with CLO#4 with 80% proficiency. The expectation is that 75% of students will meet this standard for CLO#4."

Assessed Course Alpha, No., & Title	Assessed CLO#	Standard for Success	% of Students Expected to Meet Standard
CULN 270	1, 2, 3	70% or higher will be considered meeting expectation	80% of the students are expected to meet the standard
CULN 130	1, 2, 4	A total mean score of 3 or higher, or 80%, will denote proficient	90% of the students are expected to achieve proficiency
CULN 130	3	A total mean score of 6 points or higher of 8 points, or 75%, will denote meets expectations	100% of the students are expected to achieve expectations

Results of Course Assessments

For each course assessed in AY17-18 listed above, provide:

- a statement of the quantitative results;
- a brief narrative analysis of those results.

Course Alpha/#: CULN 270

Final Exam results for the "Green and Growing" category showed the majority passed the questions for this category. Questions; 17,18,21,22, 43 & 44. Having a good understanding of sustainable practices, farm to fork, buying local & carbon footprint.

The challenge for the coming year, is providing more information and examples of activities in which food service operations engage to help reduce carbon footprint. These activities would include, water usage, electricity and green cleaning supplies.

Results of the assessment are as followed: 89% met, 11% did not meet expectations.

The instructors have discovered using past historical evidence that a large factor in the success of this course is dependent on the strength of the student's math and reading comprehension skills.

Course Alpha/#: CULN 130

CLO 1, 2, 4: There was a relatively broad range in the results. 44.4% exceeded expectations, 22.2% met, 22.2% partially met, and 11.1% did not meet expectations.

Overall, the majority of the students met or exceeded expectations in all areas being assessed. Standards of grooming and dress were well performed. Despite the increase in visual learning tools and online resources from the previous course assessment, there was still a relatively wide range of scores within "Skills and Technique", "Mise en Place", and "Production and Focus". This may be attributed to the broad level of skills each individual student possess when entering this "open enrollment" program.

CLO 3: Prior assessment of this CLO proved challenging. The rubric used in the report was difficult for many students to understand despite the majority of them meeting expectations, thus that rubric was not used for this CLO. Instructors will need to create a rubric that provides more clarity of expectations and/or will need to reword CLO #3 in order to measure student achievement more accurately. Despite this challenge, all the students who participated in this project found it to be a positive experience.

Other Comments

Include any additional information that will help clarify the program's course assessment results, successes and challenges.

Overall, students have shown a marked improvement in skills attained throughout the program. This can be attributed to the program's high student contact hours, combined with rigor within all of the lab courses.

Discuss, if relevant, a summary of student survey results, CCSSE, e-CAFE, graduate-leaver surveys, special evaluations, or other assessment instruments that are not discussed elsewhere in this report.

e-CAFÉ – Some students have mentioned in the past about the rigor of the program. The number of ACF required skill competencies are very high for a two year program. The

immense rate that we need to cover all of the competencies has been found to create a lower rate of retention for many students because some topics cannot be revisited without falling behind in the curriculum.

Next Steps – ASSESSMENT ACTION PLAN for AY18-19

Describe the program’s intended next steps to improve student learning, based on the program’s overall AY17-18 assessment results.

Include any specific strategies, tactics, activities or plans for improvement in program or course assessment practices, methods or tools, rubrics, schedules, etc.

Instructors will continue to increase visual learning tools. The program is making plans to also acquire and install video and monitor capabilities in this course to allow for increased visual teaching strategies. The program is also focused on updating kitchen equipment which will help facilitate the learning outcomes and improve the learning environment.

Instructors will need to create a rubric that provides more clarity of expectations for CLO #3 in CULN 130.

Moving forward, instructors will plan to work with The Learning Center coordinator to see about the possibilities of getting an in class math tutor the next time this course is offered. Instructors will also conduct a solid review of the ACF competencies for food and beverage management to ensure that this course is up to date with the current skills competencies.

PART 4: ADDITIONAL DATA

Cost Per SSH (to be provided by Admin)

Please provide the following values used to determine the total fund amount and the cost per SSH for your program:

General Funds = \$ _____
Federal Funds = \$ _____
Other Funds = \$ _____
Tuition and Fees = \$ _____

External Data*

If your program utilizes external licensures, enter:

Number sitting for an exam _____

Number passed _____

***This section applies to NURS only.**