HAWAI‘I COMMUNITY COLLEGE
PROGRAM ANNUAL REVIEW (APR)

Creative Media, AS
Digital Media Arts, CO

January 10, 2019

Review Period
July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018

Initiator: Meidor Hu
Writer(s): Meidor Hu

Program/Unit Review at Hawai‘i Community College is a shared governance responsibility related to strategic planning and quality assurance. Annual and 3-year Comprehensive Reviews are important planning tools for the College’s budget process. This ongoing systematic assessment process supports achievement of Program/Unit and Institutional Outcomes. Evaluated through a college-wide procedure, all completed Program/Unit Reviews are available to the College and community at large to enhance communication and public accountability. Please see http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/files/program-unit-review/

Please remember that this review should be written in a professional manner. Mahalo.
# PART 1: PROGRAM DATA AND ACTIVITIES

## Program Description (required by UH System)

| Provide the short description as listed in the current catalog. | This program prepares students for employment in the field of digital media design and production. It gives necessary education and training to students seeking entry-level positions as digital media artists and/or transfer to a Baccalaureate granting institution. It provides professionals already in the field with updated technology training. |

## Comprehensive Review information (required by UH System)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>URL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td><a href="http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/files/program-unit-review/docs/2016_dma_comprehensive_program_review.pdf">http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/files/program-unit-review/docs/2016_dma_comprehensive_program_review.pdf</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Provide a short summary of the CERC’s evaluation and recommendations from the program’s last Comprehensive Review.

Discuss any significant changes to the program that were aligned with those recommendations but are not discussed elsewhere in this report.

CERC’s evaluation of the DMA program were mostly positive. Commended the way the program review was written helps the reader understand the program, its students and the local industry. There was a good discussion of the program’s new AS degree offering, and of the program’s challenges with the ARPD date. The section explaining the program’s contributions to the college was very informative and gives the reader a clear sense of the passion of the program faculty in helping their students meet the mission and ILOs.

CERC recommended for the program to analyze and discuss Perkins indicators, instead of just listing it. Also, that the program should capitalize on its STEM designation.

No significant changes related to the recommendations by CERC, as the program does not ask for Perkins Funding. The problem also does not have a clear strategy on how to capitalize on the STEM designation.

## ARPD Data: Analysis of Quantitative Indicators (required by UH System)

Program data can be found on the ARPD website: [http://www.hawaii.edu/offices/cc/arpd/](http://www.hawaii.edu/offices/cc/arpd/)

Please attach a copy of the program’s data tables
and submit with this Annual Program Review (APR).

a) If you will be submitting the APR in hard copy, print and staple a copy of the data tables to the submission; the icon to print the data tables is on the upper right side, just above the data tables.

OR

b) If you will be submitting the APR in digital form (WORD or PDF), attach a PDF copy of the data tables along with the digital submission; the icon to download the data tables as a PDF is in the upper right of the screen, just above the data tables.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analyze the program’s ARPD data for the review period.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Describe, discuss, and provide context for the data, including the program’s health scores in the following categories:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Demand | Our Demand Indicators continues to be UNHEALTHY. CM-DMA continues to (and will continue to) have an unhealthy demand indicator score due to the high number of majors (10 - Demand Indicator #3) being significantly greater than the number of new and replacement positions available that are county prorated (3 positions - Demand Indicator #2.) As noted in previous annual reviews, our demand indicators will continue to be unhealthy as long as the program’s CIP code is too limited to describe all the jobs available to our graduates. Our graduates will find work as self-employed free-lance web designers, photographers, graphic artists, video artists and animators – a combination of CIP codes 10.0304 and 11.0801 rather than one or the other. They will also go on to start their own businesses, which is a common practice in DMA-related fields but is not accounted for within the provided data. |

| Efficiency | Our Efficiency Indicator is CAUTIONARY. The Average Class size (Efficiency Indicator #9) is 10, a slight increase from last year. The Class Fill Rate (Efficiency Indicator #10) has increased slightly to 73.3% from last year, an increase of 10%. Our classes are capped at 14 in Hilo and 7 on the Pālamanui campus due to the number of computers available in our DMA classrooms. The Cautionary indicator may be due to the fill rate of the Pālamanui campus as the number of computer/workstations are smaller there. |

| Effectiveness | Our Effectiveness Indicator is UNHEALTHY. The number of Unduplicated Degrees/Certificates Awarded (Effectiveness Indicator #20) in the DMA Certificate program is 4, 40% our majors (Demand Indicator #3) of 10. One may be able to conclude that the students who started out as a Certificate major may be transferring to our new Associate in Science degree in Creative Media |
which was initiated in 2016 or may have also moved on to the new AA in Liberal Arts with the Concentration in Art where the Certificate of Completion is embedded. Successful Completion with a grade of C or higher, #17, is 73% of our students who enroll in our classes. This is again, encouraging but is not included in the health call calculations.

**Overall Health**
The Overall Health Call is UNHEALTHY. As long as the program is assigned a single CIP code, the new and replacement positions County Prorated will remain low. This low number will not take into consideration what work actually is available and how our students are finding work as stated in the Demand Indicator above. Our Overall Health Call will always be either Unhealthy or Cautionary as in this year. Again, as I’ve asked in previous Annual Program Reviews, what should we be moving towards? I would like to see a model program with healthy health calls in all areas to get a sense of where we should be moving towards and what we should be doing.

**Distance Education**
Our Distance Education classes remain about the same as the year before with 8 classes offered and a similar enrollment as last year; 80. The Fill Rate, #25, decreased very slightly from previous years to 70% from 71% in AY15-16 and the Successful Completion, #26, remains about the same at 59% or half the students who enrolled. Additionally, like last year, the Withdrawals from the DE classes were much lower at 8.

**Perkins Core Indicators**
We met #29: Technical Skills Attainment, #32: Student Placement, #33 Nontraditional Participation and #34, Nontraditional Completion. We did not meet #30 Completion and #31 Student Retention or Transfer. We are not sure how this applies to our program however since as I understand, we do not ask for Perkins Funding.

**Performance Funding Indicators**
N/A

**What else is relevant to understanding the program’s data?**
We are still in a similar situation as last year: As mentioned above, the DMA program has started offering classes at the Pālamanui campus with a very limited space in the STEM Center. We would like to eventually offer the CO
Describe any trends, internal/external factors, strengths and/or challenge that can help the reader understand the program’s data but are not discussed above.

In DMA completely on-line so that the students on the WH side can receive the CO degree there. Even with more majors in the CO program, our Demand Health Call will still be Unhealthy if we are given just ONE CIP code.

Challenge: Another concern is that the UH Hilo Art Dept. is starting to offer Art 112 Intro to Digital Arts and our Art 107D Digital Photography classes, which are a direct duplicate of our classes. In the past, UHH students came to take our classes but they no longer come to take our class since UHH started teaching those foundational classes.

PROGRAM ACTIVITIES

Report and discuss all major actions and activities that occurred in the program during the review period, including the program’s meaningful accomplishments and successes. Also discuss the challenges or obstacles the program faced in supporting student success and explain what the program did to address those challenges.

For example, discuss:

- Changes to the program’s curriculum due to course additions, deletions, modifications (CRC, Fast Track, GE-designations), and re-sequencing;
- New certificates/degrees;
- Personnel and/or position additions and/or losses;
- Other changes to the program’s operations or services to students.

- We continue to receive support and funding from the Academy for Creative Media (ACM) UH System Office.
- The DMA Program Coordinating Council (PCC) met in May to discuss alignment of course Teaching Equivalencies for similar courses as well as titles and course description.
- With changes to the curriculum in other programs, the CM/DMA courses are similarly affected.
- At the end of 2018, a full-time DMA/CM instructor retired. This change will negatively affect the program if the position is not filled in a timely manner.

PROGRAM WEBSITE

Has the program recently reviewed its website? Please check the box below that best applies and follow through as needed to keep the program’s website up-to-date.

☐ Program faculty/staff have reviewed the website in the past six months, no changes needed.
Program faculty/staff reviewed the website in the past six months and submitted a change request to the College’s webmaster on _____________ (date).

Program faculty/staff recently reviewed the website as a part of the annual program review process, found that revisions are needed, and will submit a change request to College’s webmaster in a timely manner.

Please note that requests for revisions to program websites must be submitted directly to the College’s webmaster at http://hawaii.hawaii.edu/web-developer

PART 2: PROGRAM ACTION PLAN

AY17-18 ACTION PLAN

Provide a detailed narrative discussion of the program’s overall action plan for AY17-18, based on analysis of the Program’s AY16-17 data and the overall results of course learning outcomes assessments conducted during the AY16-17 review period. This Action Plan should identify the program’s specific goals and objectives for AY18-19, and must provide benchmarks or timelines for achieving each goal.

The following have been identified as Action Plans for AY 18-19 and beyond:

1. Secure funding for and services of a dedicated tutor for special needs/rehab students in CM/DMA classes. We have met with Mari Giel, Disability Services Office Counselor, to discuss this need and she has agreed to work with our program to seek funding for, or to provide funding for, a tutor to assist our Special Needs students.

2. Secure a 2+2 agreement with UH-Hilo and UHWO for transfer students; work with Transfer Coordinator to make sure CM/DMA students’ transfer process is smooth. We currently have an AS degree in Creative Media degree that is transferable to UHWO. Additionally, we have met with the UH Hilo Art reps and our Transfer Coordinator is working out the details so that our students may transfer smoothly into their program. However, there are roadblocks to this at the moment. The 2 + 2 with UHH Art Dept. is contingent with their agreement to our proposal.

3. Resolve issues with the UHH Art Dept. re: them offering lower-level courses that already
are being offered by the HawCC program.

4. Continue to work with the ACM System to receive funding in support of the program. So far, we have been receiving $52,500 annually for hardware, software and other misc. equipment to build the program. On-going.

ACTION ITEMS TO ACCOMPLISH ACTION PLAN

For each Action Item below, describe the strategies, tactics, initiatives, innovations, activities, etc., that the program plans to implement in order to accomplish the goals described in the Action Plan above.
For each Action Item below, discuss how implementing this action will help lead to improvements in student learning and their attainment of the program’s learning outcomes (PLOs).

**Action Item 1:** Secure a dedicated tutor for Disability Students in the class. Tutor/tutoring helps students with disabilities in completing and understanding the software and assignments. Without the extra assistance, students may not complete the assignment and therefore may fail the class.

**Action Item 2:** Secure a 2+2 agreement with UH-Hilo and UHWO for transfer students; we already have an AS transfer degree with the UHWO Creative Media BA degree. However, as stated above, UH Hilo has been less than cooperative in accepting our lower division courses for their 2 + 2 degree with our AS degree. We have to wait to see whether they will accept our classes and credits.

**Action Item 3.** Open communication with UHH to resolve so of these issues.

**Action Item 4.** Continue to request funding from UH ACM system to support the DMA and AS degree programs.

RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS

*NOTE: General “budget asks” are included in the 3-year Comprehensive Review. Budget asks for the following three categories only may be included in the APR: 1) health and safety needs, 2) emergency needs, and/or 3) necessary needs to become compliant with Federal/State laws/regulations.*

Provide a brief statement about any implications of or challenges due to the program’s current operating resources.
• The current operating cost of the program is provided by a grant from the Academy for Creative Media (ACM) UH System Office.

BUDGET ASKS

For budget ask in the allowed categories (see above):

| Describe the needed item(s) in detail. | None needed at this time. |
| Include estimated cost(s) and timeline(s) for procurement. | See above. |
| Explain how the item(s) aligns with one or more of the strategic initiatives of 2015-2021 Strategic Directions: | N/A |


PART 3: LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENTS

For all parts of this section, please provide information based on CLO (course learning outcomes) or PLO (program learning outcomes) assessments conducted in AY16-17.

Evidence of Industry Validation and Participation in Assessment (for CTE programs only)
Provide documentation that the program has submitted evidence and achieved certification or accreditation (if applicable) from an organization granting certification/accreditation in the program’s industry/profession. If the program/degree/certificate does not have a certifying body,
you must submit evidence of the program’s advisory committee’s/board’s recommendations for, approval of, and/or participation in the program’s assessment(s).

Please attach copy of industry validation for the year under review.

Courses Assessed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessed Course Alpha, No., &amp; Title</th>
<th>Semester assessed</th>
<th>CLOs assessed (CLO#s)</th>
<th>PLO alignment (PLO#s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ART 126 – 3D Computer Graphics</td>
<td>Fall 2017</td>
<td>&quot;CLO1: Demonstrate the basic technological processes of 3D computer graphics.&quot;</td>
<td>1 - DMA 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;CLO2: Demonstrate through completed course projects how 3D computer graphics are used as an art tool in form modeling and animation.&quot;</td>
<td>2 - DMA 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;CLO3: Use 3D computer graphics to generate and apply the visual elements of 3D modeling, shading, lighting, and render techniques.&quot;</td>
<td>3 - DMA 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ART 120 - Intro to Typography</td>
<td>Spring 2018</td>
<td>CLO1: Create a variety of typeface and letter forms using appropriate software.</td>
<td>1 – DMA 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CLO2: Prepare professional quality typography design projects.</td>
<td>2 – DMA 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CLO3: Demonstrate professionalism with a digital portfolio.</td>
<td>3 – DMA 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ART 115 – Intro to 2D Design</td>
<td>Spring 2018</td>
<td>CLO1: Demonstrate proficiency in using the elements of design and the principles of composition.</td>
<td>1 – DMA 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CLO2: Utilize compositional skills to create successful two-dimensional pictorial work.</td>
<td>2 – DMA 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CLO3: Effectively communicate visual information.</td>
<td>3 – DMA 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CLO4: Demonstrate the ability to activate the concept of the picture plane.</td>
<td>4 – DMA 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Assessment Strategies

For each course assessed in AY17-18 listed above, provide a brief description of the assessment strategy, including:

- a description of the type of student work or activity assessed (e.g., research paper, lab report, hula performance, etc.);
- a description of how student artefacts were selected for assessment (e.g., the assessment included summative assignments from all students in the course, OR a sample of students’ summative assignments was randomly selected for assessment based on a representative percentage of students in each section of the course);
- a brief discussion of the assessment rubric/scoring guide and the criteria/categories and standards used in the assessment.

Course Alpha/#: ART 126 – 3D Computer Graphics

- The Artifacts are the final digital 3D Computer Graphics.

- 100% or all the artifacts were assessed.

- The rubric used scorings of Exceeds Expectation or highly effective in demonstrating attainment of CLO, Meets Expectation or average attainment of CLO and Does Not Meet Expectation or little or no attainment of the CLO assessed. Points were given to each level, totaled and then divided by the total number of artefacts.

Instructor conducted assessment alone for Art 126, 3D Computer Graphics I. Instructor has a business which provides 3D graphics and animation services. Assessment is based on required final animations from students and demonstrates if students learned and understood exercises and assignments during course.

Course Alpha/#: ART 120 -- Intro to Typography

Assessed student work: Typography Portfolio

Instructor conducted assessment alone for Art 120, Introduction to Typography. Assessment is based on required Final Portfolio from students and demonstrates if students learned and understood exercises and assignments during the course.
All students were assessed and Instructor expects 75% of students to achieve the course learning outcome CLO1.

**Course Alpha/#: ART 115 -- Intro to 2D Design**
Assessment was conducted by Meidor Hu, Renee Visaya, John and Kaori Lang. Art115 is in a small group unit. Assessment is based on required final portfolio from three section courses by three instructors. A representative random sample of students portfolio from each instructor. Samples are from about 50% of face to face one section and two online sections.

75% of students expected to achieve the course learning outcome.

---

### Expected Levels of Achievement

For each course assessed in AY17-18 listed above, state the standard (benchmark, goal) for student success for each CLO assessed AND the percentage of students expected to meet that standard for each CLO.

*Example:* “CLO#1: The standard for student success is that students will answer 80% of the questions on the final exam related to CLO#1 correctly. The expectation is that 85% of students will meet this standard for CLO#1.”

*Example:* “CLO#3: The standard for student success is that students will be able to perform skills associated with CLO34 with 80% proficiency. The expectation is that 75% of students will meet this standard for CLO#3.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessed Course Alpha, No., &amp; Title</th>
<th>Assessed CLO#</th>
<th>Standard for Success</th>
<th>% of Students Expected to Meet Standard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ART 126 3-D Computer Graphics</td>
<td>1, 2, 3</td>
<td>75% of course content for all CLOs</td>
<td>85% of students will Meet or Exceed standard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ART 120 Intro to Typography</td>
<td>1,2,3</td>
<td>75% (3 of 4 points) of course content for all CLOs</td>
<td>75% of students will Meet or Exceed standard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ART 115 Intro to 2D Design</td>
<td>1, 2, 3</td>
<td>66% (2 of 3 points) of course content for all CLOs</td>
<td>75% of students will Meet or Exceed standard</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### Results of Course Assessments

For each course assessed in AY17-18 listed above, provide:

- a statement of the quantitative results;
- a brief narrative analysis of those results.

**Course Alpha/#: ART 126:**

---

Page 11
Document Steward: IAC
rev. Sept. 2018
CLO 1: 83% exceeded, 16% not met
CLO 2: 33% exceeded, 50% met, 16% not met
CLO 3: 50% exceeded, 33% met, 16% not met

Five students exceeded in demonstrating basic technological processes of 3D computer graphics. This included understand the vocabulary and function of Maya and other 3D graphics programs. Understand how 3D graphics are used in several industries. Demonstrate a basic understanding of the Maya tool sets. Become competent at using Maya 3D to create simple 3D objects and models, create basic surfaces and lighting and generate basic animations.

Challenges: One student joined the Army and other students had personal and family issues. It was a challenge working with some of these schedules, although most students communicated by email and completed their exercises and assignments. Maya is free for students to download and this is a positive factor, allowing students to work at home.

One student was a no-show during the entire semester and did not withdraw from the course roster and did not meet the threshold.

I believe overall the results show that the course was successful with having all students meeting expectations. Students submitted a digital portfolio showcasing all major assignments for the course. The portfolios displayed the use of typography they learned throughout the semester and the results showed professionalism. Students were able to create a variety of typefaces and letter forms. There was one student who struggled with communication and it showed in the student’s body of work. The student met expectations but could have done even better if the appropriate software was used.

Course Alpha/#: ART 120

CLO 1 and CLO 2:
Exceeded  44.44%  Number at this level: 4
Met       44.44%  Number at this level: 4
Partially Met 11.11%  Number at this level: 1
Not Met   0%  Number at this level: 0

CLO 3:
Exceeded  33.33%  Number at this level: 3
Met       55.56%  Number at this level: 5
Partially Met 11.11%  Number at this level: 1
Not Met   0%  Number at this level: 0
I believe overall the results show that the course was successful with having all students meeting expectations. Students submitted a digital portfolio showcasing all major assignments for the course. The portfolios displayed the use of typography they learned throughout the semester and the results showed professionalism. Students were able to create a variety of typefaces and letter forms. There was one student who struggled with communication and it showed in the student’s body of work. The student met expectations but could have done even better if the appropriate software was used.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Alpha/#: ART 115</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>CLO 1:</strong> 40% exceeded, 46.67 met, 13.33% not met</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CLO 2:</strong> 46% exceeded, 40% met, 13.33% not met</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CLO 3:</strong> 40% exceeded, 46.67 met, 13.33% not met</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CLO 3:</strong> 46% exceeded, 40% met, 13.33% not met</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As over-all result, all 4 CLO’s result were almost same and all were achieved to meet expectation. This revealed all instructors covered all of CLO evenly and managed well teaching method individually.

CLO1: Demonstrate Proficiency in using the elements of design and the principles of composition.
6 students met exceed the expectation. 7 students met expectations and 2 did not meet expectations. This included understand the meaning of each vocabulary and its effectively use the design elements and principle of design such as line, shape, pattern, texture, balance, rhythm and unity in two-dimensional works.

CLO2: Utilize compositional skills to create successful two-dimensional pictorial work.
7 students met exceed the expectation. 6 students met expectations and 2 did not meet expectations. This included effectively use the design elements and principle of design such as line, shape, pattern, texture, balance, rhythm and unity to create a successful two dimensional composition works.

CLO3: Effectively communicate visual information.
7 students met exceed the expectation. 6 students met expectations and 2 did not meet expectations. This included effectively use the design elements and principle of design such as line, shape, pattern, texture, balance, rhythm and unity to communicate visual information to create a successful two dimensional pictorial work.

CLO4: Demonstrate the ability to activate the concept of the picture plane.
7 students exceed the expectation. 6 students met expectations and 2 did not meet expectations. This included effectively use the design elements and principle of design such as line, shape, pattern, texture, balance, rhythm and unity to activate the concept of the picture plane to create a successful two dimensional pictorial work.

Strengths and Challenges of the course unit:
Assessment result revealed Over 75% of sample student's portfolio achieved the course learning outcome. This revealed that the strength of the course students included design elements and principles in their portfolio. The challenges were that one out of the three instructors had different prompts and therefore some students didn't meet the CLO.

Other Comments
Include any additional information that will help clarify the program’s course assessment results, successes and challenges.

Discuss, if relevant, a summary of student survey results, CCSSE, e-CAFE, graduate-leaver surveys, special evaluations, or other assessment instruments that are not discussed elsewhere in this report.

Next Steps – ASSESSMENT ACTION PLAN for AY18-19
Describe the program’s intended next steps to improve student learning, based on the program’s overall AY17-18 assessment results.
Include any specific strategies, tactics, activities or plans for improvement to program or course curriculum or instructional strategies, or changes in program or course assessment practices.

We plan to do a Closing-the-Loop assessment for the next cycle year when they will be offered – 2018 -2019, to confirm that the CLO’s are being met. We will vet suggested changes with our Advisory Council members when we have our annual meeting next Feb. to see if they recommend these changes. The program will be planning on more curricular changes to reflect the class offerings of the next few years.
PART 4: ADDITIONAL DATA

Cost Per SSH (to be provided by Admin)
Please provide the following values used to determine the total fund amount and the cost per SSH for your program:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Funds</td>
<td>$_______</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Funds</td>
<td>$_______</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Funds</td>
<td>$_______</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuition and Fees</td>
<td>$_______</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

External Data*

If your program utilizes external licensures, enter:

Number sitting for an exam _____
Number passed _____

*This section applies to NURS only.