

HAWAI`I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

Tutoring

November 27, 2013

July 1, 2012 to June 30, 2013

Initiator: Joni Onishi

Writer(s): Gwen Kimura

Program/Unit Review at Hawai'i Community College is a shared governance responsibility related to strategic planning and quality assurance. It is an important planning tool for the college budget process. Achievement of Program/Unit Outcomes is embedded in this ongoing systematic assessment. Reviewed by a college-wide process, the Program/Unit Reviews are available to the college and community at large to enhance communication and public accountability.

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE
ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

CERC Comments and Feedback (If you submitted a Comprehensive Unit Review in 2011 or 2012, please complete this section)

CERC gave recommendations intended as suggestions for improvement. Provide a brief response to the suggestions made. i.e. Were suggestion(s) valid? What change(s) were made as a result of the suggestion(s)?, etc.

CERC provided a very in-depth analysis of TLC/HKATC's Comprehensive Review with commendations and recommendations for improvement. The following are responses to the suggestions made and changes made as a result of their comments:

1. CERC suggested that focus groups be conducted to examine service needs, determine how to attract more students to the Center, and discuss what outreach strategies would work to increase student usage of tutoring services.

A focus group, conducted on September 1, 2011, addressed the above CERC recommendation. Twenty participants comprised of tutors, clerks, TLC staff, and faculty coordinators discussed and brainstormed strategies that targeted the concerns. As a result of this session, some of the strategies have been implemented as Unit Assessment Plans (i.e. early alert system) and will be discussed in this report.

2. CERC reviewers commented that data on the efficiency and effectiveness of the computer lab be included to determine whether the facilities and staffing are adequate in meeting the demand.

Data on the efficiency and effectiveness of computer lab usage supporting the need for human, financial, and physical resources have been included in this report.

3. CERC reviewers recommended that fiscal and human resources be budget priority items to address the high demand for testing services and computer lab usage at HKATC.

Fiscal and human resources have been included in this new Annual Review Report as a budget request.

4. CERC reviewers suggested that other budget priority items be included to replace old computers, printers, a print-card system so that it is self-sustaining, new programs, software...

Budgetary items have been listed in this report.

Unit Description (In addition, give more in depth explanation of what the unit does, who it serves and generally describe its accomplishments)

The Learning Center (TLC) is an academic support program of Hawai'i Community College which is a shared service with University of Hawai'i at Hilo. Over the years, TLC has maintained its strong ties to instruction, providing faculty with an extension to their classroom and providing academic support college-wide. Its basic role of supporting faculty and students in reading, writing, math, and ESL continues to be the focus which provides a firm academic foundation for all students. Along with these

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

services, TLC provides academic resources in the form of instructional materials, computers/programs, a multi-media classroom, open lab for computers/independent study, make-up testing, and tutoring. TLC is open Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 4:15 p.m. The staff includes: one full time Faculty Center Coordinator, one full time Clerk Steno II (Office Manager), one full time Educational Specialist A, four Faculty Lab Instructors (reading, writing, ESL, and math who are assigned three credits each to coordinate their area), ten clerks, and 39 tutors.

TLC services include:

- Tutoring – Reading Lab, ESL Lab, Math, Writing, Content Subjects, Learning Skills, computer assistance
- Academic resources in the form of instructional materials, computers/programs for instructional purposes
- A multi-media classroom
- General study/with computers
- Make-up testing
- Clearinghouse for community request for tutors (unadvertised)

Part I: Quantitative Indicators

NO ENTRY

Part II: Analysis of the Unit

Alignment with College Mission and ILOs

Write a brief narrative describing the unit and how it supports the College's mission and Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs).

College's mission:

Hawai'i Community College (Hawai'iCC) promotes student learning by embracing our unique Hawai'i Island culture and inspiring growth in the spirit of "E`Imi Pono." Aligned with the UH Community Colleges system's mission, we are committed to serving all segments of our Hawai'i Island community.

Unit Mission:

The mission of The Learning Center (TLC) and Hale Kea Advancement and Testing Center (HKATC) as an academic support program for the college needs to be a responsive one which supports the college's

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

mission and its academic programs. TLC and HKATC seek to provide services that support and enhance academic development for the college community. These services focus on academic support for an "open door" institution, providing initial student assessment, access to technology, support for successful learning, and testing services.

Describe how this unit supports the College's mission.

The College's mission and Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs) are embedded in the Centers' mission by providing services, "that support and enhance academic development for the college community..." The Centers have evolved over the years to keep up with the needs of our diverse student population, rapidly changing technology, instructional delivery methods, and researched- based best practices to promote quality support for students and faculty. Aligned with HawCC's vision, the Centers focus on providing a supportive learning environment where students can improve or enhance their lives academically, professionally, and/or personally to become productive citizens of a global community.

Describe how this unit supports the College's Institutional Learning Outcomes below.

ILO 1: Our graduates will be able to communicate effectively in a variety of situations.

Describe how the Unit supports ILO1:

TLC/HKATC support this first ILO by assisting students with reading, writing, and English as a Second Language. Helping students develop good reading skills familiarizes them with the written word which increases their vocabulary. A good reader develops a better understanding of the structure of language and in turn becomes a better writer. Improving writing skills encourages students to communicate more readily with their instructors, their peers, and finally within their community. Assisting students who are non-native speakers to acquire a better knowledge of English will encourage them to communicate with native speakers more easily and often. Having good communication skills gives the students confidence which is important for them in becoming independent learners.

The following are excerpts of responses from tutors who felt they supported this ILO when tutoring in their subject area:

- ...we help bridge the gap that students often feel between themselves and their teachers.
- As writing tutors, we offer a direct correlation between becoming effective writers and effective communicators.
- I work to help students convey their ideas in an organized and accurate manner so that they can effectively communicate in various situations. With good communication comes empowerment and confidence...
- In writing and ESL, I assist students to express their ideas or feelings on paper. Effective communication is occurring both ways by the student expressing their feelings and me asking the appropriate questions to get them thinking.

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

- Through valuable discussions and meaningful interactions, tutoring sessions open the door for exceptional dialogue and receptive discussions.
- From my own experience, I can assure you that The Learning Center does an amazing job by helping students to be able to communicate effectively. As a non-native English speaker, I am really thankful to all of the members of The Learning Center that helped me to be able to communicate effectively in a variety of situations.

ILO 2: Our graduates will be able to gather, evaluate and analyze ideas and information to use in overcoming challenges, solving problems and making decisions.

Describe how the Unit supports ILO 2:

Students coming to TLC/HKATC are assisted in gathering, evaluating, and analyzing ideas and information in a variety of ways. This is what is better known as critical thinking. Being able to think critically helps students to overcome challenges, solve problems and make decisions that will affect the rest of their lives. Helping students develop good math and reading skills will help them develop good critical thinking skills. Math is a logical science that presents a set pattern of variables to be followed to come to an exact answer. Reading is a more difficult application that asks the reader to extract information from the ideas put forth in order to gain knowledge and draw conclusions. These different methods of analysis prepare students for the challenges of problem solving in making important life decisions.

The following are excerpts of responses from tutors who felt they supported this ILO when tutoring in their subject area:

- In relation to everyday situations, students will be able to employ the learned skills/strategies that were put into use while completing schoolwork, and apply them to daily situations that require critical thinking, and problem-solving, in turn, overcome challenges.
- By showing students how to gather, evaluate, and analyze information effectively, I am providing students with problem solving tools that will help them overcome the challenges they face throughout life.
- ...math is all about being able to analyze what you know and use it to solve problems. Of course, life doesn't usually just throw formulas at us, so I encourage the students to really try hard with word problems (which are the hardest problems in a math book). If they can become adept at pulling out the important information from a paragraph of text and then setting up the problem, they can transfer this to all of their other classes.

ILO 3: Our graduates will develop the knowledge, skills and values to make contributions to our community in a manner that respects diversity and Hawaiian culture.

Describe how the Unit supports ILO 3:

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

Hawaii Community College is a culturally diverse institution. This speaks highly of the community as a whole since there are so many different cultures that have come together to live on this island. When local students come to TLC/HKATC, they come in already having the experience of living with different cultures. When students from other places come here, they are being immersed in that cultural diversity and gaining great knowledge of a collective community. The Centers cater to this diversity not only by assisting students that are learning English as a Second Language, but by also having a culturally diverse staff that is sensitive to the needs of the community. Students who come to the Centers for tutoring, leave with the knowledge, skills and values they need to make contributions to the community in a manner that respects diversity and the Hawaiian culture.

The following are excerpts of responses from tutors who felt they supported this ILO when tutoring in their subject area:

- When students develop the things we teach them, they develop knowledge and values that allow them to make positive contributions to our community, which not only benefits our academic community but also benefits our whole community.
- One of the biggest steps in learning a culture is to learn the language and it is gratifying to see people in ESL learn about a different culture alongside the acquisition of the language.
- I firmly believe that people learn and teach one another through effective communication, critical thinking, and in conjunction with the practice of Hawaiian culture, the community benefits.

Annual Report of Unit Data (ARPD)

Based on the data from this Unit's ARPD, analyze the Unit's strengths and weaknesses in terms of demand, efficiency, effectiveness, and any other data provided. Disregard Indicators not relevant to your unit.

Overall Health-- Healthy

Demand -- Healthy

Strengths:

Demand for TLC/HKATC tutoring services is healthy as evidenced by the following data:

- The percentage of unduplicated number of students tutored in one-on-one sessions per student FTE was 44%, placing it in the healthy category of the scoring rubric.
- The percentage of unduplicated students enrolled in Dev/Ed classes who were tutored per number of students enrolled in Dev/Ed classes was 40%, placing it in the healthy category of the scoring rubric.

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

Weaknesses:

- Because data for tutoring services only reflect TLC, the percentage of unduplicated students enrolled in Dev.Ed classes who were tutored may be higher because students may be receiving tutoring elsewhere.

Efficiency -- Healthy

Strengths:

Efficiency is healthy as evidenced by the following data:

- Tutor contact hours per tutor paid hours in one-on-one sessions was 2, placing it in the healthy category of the scoring rubric.
- Tutoring budget per student contact hours was \$15.00, placing it in the healthy category of the scoring rubric.

Weaknesses:

- Although tutor contact is healthy, 2, it dropped from 2.7 from the previous year.
- Although the budget is healthy, \$15.00, it increased from \$12.00 from the previous year.

Effectiveness -- Healthy

Strengths:

Effectiveness is healthy as evidenced by the following data:

- CCSSE survey results (averaged mean score) was 2.0, placing it in the healthy category.
- Persistence rate was 74%, placing it in the healthy category.

Weaknesses:

Although the passing rate of tutored students was 68%, placing it in the cautionary category, it increased 3% from 65% from the previous year.

(See Appendix A for Tutoring Data)

(See Appendix B for Tutoring Rubric)

Other Data

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

Significant Unit Actions for 2012-2013. (include gain/loss of positions, changes in procedures, etc.)

1.	
2.	
3.	

Analysis of Strengths and Weaknesses

Briefly describe the unit's top 3 strengths and 3 weaknesses. Provide an explanation and supporting evidence for each strength and weakness (e.g. assessment results, data elements from ARPD, surveys, etc.)

Strengths	Using supporting evidence, describe why this is a strength
S1. Demand	Approximately 937 unduplicated students out of 2114 Student FTE were tutored in one-on-one sessions. 582 unduplicated students out of 1479 enrolled in rem/dev classes received tutoring.
S2. Efficiency	Approximately two students were tutored in an hour in one-on-one sessions at a cost of \$15.00 per tutor.
S3. Effectiveness	CCSSE results average mean score was 2.0 in the sometimes/somewhat range for frequency, satisfaction, and importance for tutoring and use of skill labs.

Weaknesses	Using supporting evidence, describe why this is a Weakness
W1. Effectiveness	68% of the students passed their classes with tutoring. The goal is to raise the pass rates to 70% and above to get specific classes off the gatekeepers list and to help students be successful at the next level course.
W2. Demand	Better data collection need to be implemented for tracking and reporting purposes.
W3. Effectiveness	According to CCSSE, the mean score of 1.55 was given for

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

	frequency of using peer or other tutoring. If this number could be increased, students may become more actively engaged and more likely to learn and persist toward achieving their academic goals.
--	---

Trends and Other Factors

Describe trends including comparisons to any applicable standards, such as government regulations, national standards from accrediting associations, etc. Include, if relevant, a summary of Satisfaction Survey Results, special studies and/or instruments used, e.g., CCSSE, etc. Describe any external factors affecting the unit or additional unit changes not included elsewhere.

Part III: Action Plan

Goals and Planning

List the top 3 immediate Unit Actions (Goals) for this unit for unit success. Identify the AMP Priorities (if applicable), College's ILOs, Strategic Plan Action Strategies, and UH System collaboration (if applicable) to which these Unit Action(s) align.

For Academic Support Units: List additional Unit Action(s), not included in the AMP to be implemented for unit success. Identify the AMP Priorities, College's ILOs, Strategic Plan Action Strategies, and UH System collaboration (if applicable) to which these Program Action(s) align.

Unit Action 1	AMP Priorities (disregard if NA)	ILO Alignment (select up to 3)	Strategic Plan Alignment (select best alignment; max 3)		UH System Collaboration
			Performance Measure	Action Strategy	
Seek funding to pilot tutor mentoring project	Graduation	ILO 1	A2.3	d.	
	Graduation	ILO 2	A2.4	f.	
	Graduation	ILO 3	B.3	c.	

[Link to Hawaii Community College Institutional Learning Outcomes](#)

[Link to Hawai'i Community College Strategic Plan](#)

[Link to Hawaii Community College Academic Master Plan](#)

Narrative of New Strategy for Strategic Plan:

1.

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

2.
3.

Briefly explain how **Unit Action 1** aligns to the College's AMP Priorities (if applicable), ILOs, Strategic Plan, and UH System collaboration (if applicable):

In the AMP, which aligns with Strategic Plans A2.3, A2.4, and B.3, TLC/HKATC stated as a priority that it will look for ways to provide tutoring options for students in courses with low success rates and especially for those students who are in the STEM programs.

Calendar of planned activities for **Unit Action 1** – In chronological order, briefly describe the procedures/activities planned to achieve **Unit Action 1**

Activity(ies)	When will the activity take place
Example: Fire Drill	Fall 2014
Request funds	Spring 2014
Implement project	Fall 2014

Unit Action 2	AMP Priorities (disregard if NA)	ILO Alignment (select up to 3)	Strategic Plan Alignment (select best alignment; max 3)		UH System Collaboration
			Performance Measure	Action Strategy	
	Graduation	ILO 1	A1.1	New Strategy	
	Graduation	ILO 1	A1.1	New Strategy	
	Graduation	ILO 1	A1.1	New Strategy	

Narrative of New Action Strategy for Strategic Plan:

1.
2.
3.

Briefly explain how **Unit Action 2** aligns to the College's AMP Priorities (if applicable), ILOs, Strategic Plan, and UH System collaboration (if applicable):

--

Calendar of planned activities for **Unit Action 2** – In chronological order, briefly describe the procedures/activities planned to achieve **Unit Action 2**

Activity	When will the activity take place

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE
ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

Unit Action 3	AMP Priorities (disregard if NA)	ILO Alignment (select up to 3)	Strategic Plan Alignment (select best alignment; max 3)		UH System Collaboration
			Performance Measure	Action Strategy	
	Graduation	ILO 1	A1.1	New Strategy	
	Graduation	ILO 1	A1.1	New Strategy	
	Graduation	ILO 1	A1.1	New Strategy	

Narrative of New Strategy for Strategic Plan:

1.
2.
3.

Briefly explain how **Unit Action 3** aligns to the College's AMP Priorities (if applicable), ILOs, Strategic Plan, and UH System collaboration (if applicable):

--

Calendar of planned activities for **Unit Action 3** – In chronological order, briefly describe the procedures/activities planned to achieve **Unit Action 3**

Activity	When will the activity take place

Part IV: Resource Implications

List Top 3 Cost Items needed for unit success. Identify alignment to the AMP Program Actions (if applicable), Strategic Plan Action Strategies and/or Strengths and/or Weaknesses to address.

Cost Item 1	Type	Cost	Strategic Plan Alignment (select best alignment; max 3)	AMP Alignment (select best alignment; max 3)	Strength	Weakness

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

				Action Strategy	Program Action from AMP (ie 4.3) or write "New Strategy"	From Part II above	From Part II above
Fund two math tutors to be mentors to a rem/dev math (ABCD) course	Personnel	2,000	A2.3	d.		S1	W1
			A2.4	f.		None	None
			B.3	c.		None	None

[Link to Hawaii Community College Institutional Learning Outcomes](#)

[Link to Hawai'i Community College Strategic Plan](#)

[Link to Hawaii Community College Academic Master Plan](#)

Briefly explain why **Cost Item 1** is necessary to meet priorities of unit and/or to address strengths and/or weaknesses.

In order to carry out the tutor mentoring project, two math tutors would need to be hired to work four hours a week each for 16 weeks. Funding of these two math tutors will allow them to be assigned to work with 10 students each for one math ABCD class in assisting students to successfully complete their course.

Cost Item 2	Type	Cost	Strategic Plan Alignment (select best alignment; max 3)		Academic Master Plan Alignment (select best alignment; max 3)	Strength	Weakness
				Action Strategy	Program Action from AMP (ie 4.3) or write "New Strategy"		
	Equipment		A1.1	New Strategy		S1	W1
			A1.1	New Strategy		S1	W1
			A1.1	New Strategy		S1	W1

Briefly explain why **Cost Item 2** is necessary to meet priorities of unit and/or to address strengths and/or weaknesses.

Cost Item 3	Type	Cost	Strategic Plan Alignment (select best alignment; max 3)		Academic Master Plan Alignment (select best alignment; max 3)	Strength	Weakness
				Action Strategy	Action from AMP (ie 4.3) or write "New Strategy"		
	Equipment		A1.1	New Strategy		S1	W1

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

			A1.1	New Strategy		S1	W1
			A1.1	New Strategy		S1	W1

Briefly explain why **Cost Item 3** is necessary to meet priorities of unit and/or to address strengths and/or weaknesses.

Part V: Unit Outcomes

For the 2012-2013 year, list all Unit Outcomes and check mark those assessed this year.

	Check mark if Assessed this year	Unit Outcomes
1	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	TLC/HKATC will provide tutoring services for students to support their success in their academic endeavors.
2	<input type="checkbox"/>	
3	<input type="checkbox"/>	
4	<input type="checkbox"/>	
5	<input type="checkbox"/>	
6	<input type="checkbox"/>	
7	<input type="checkbox"/>	
8	<input type="checkbox"/>	
9	<input type="checkbox"/>	
10	<input type="checkbox"/>	

A) Expected Level of Achievement – Describe the different levels of achievement for each characteristic of the outcome(s) that were assessed. What represented “excellent,” “good,” “fair,” or “poor” performance using a defined rubric and what percentages were set as goals for student success. i.e. 85% of students will achieve good or excellent in the assessed activity

90% of the students and faculty using TLC/HKATC will feel their learning or their students’ learning increased as a result of tutoring services.

10% increase of student usage of the Centers, especially for high risk students and those enrolled in STEM related classes.

B) Assessment Strategy/Instrument – Describe what, why, where, when, and from whom assessment artifacts were collected.

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

TLC/HKATC implemented the following assessment activities to provide effective and increased number of students/faculty use of tutoring services, especially for writing and math (where students are walk-ins) and at HKATC where tutoring services began in 2010:

1. Designed referral form to be used by faculty/lecturers to refer students to TLC/HKATC for early assistance. Special attention was given to students enrolled in classes that were connected to STEM (math classes) initiatives.
2. Area Coordinators informed faculty and lecturers about TLC/HKATC services through DCs' meetings.
3. Flyers were posted around campus and in student/faculty orientation packets and services were advertised via website.
4. Classroom visitations were scheduled where tutors presented five minute orientations of Centers' services and resources.
5. Tutors were encouraged to complete their College Reading and Learning Association (CRLA) tutor certification and Area Coordinators conducted in-service training for tutors.

The following methods were used to assess and measure this unit outcome:

1. Faculty/student survey questions related to satisfaction with tutoring services were distributed to all students and faculty members using TLC/HKATC services at the end of the Fall 2012 semester. Results and comments were compiled and shared with TLC/HKATC staff, Area Coordinators, and tutors and strategies on how services could be improved were discussed.
2. Student contact statistics of use of tutoring services for the 2012-2013 academic year was compiled and analyzed.

C) Results of Unit Assessment

The performance rate of 90% set for students feeling that their learning increased as a result of tutoring services was met. An average of 92% of the students rated the Centers in the strongly agree/agree category in helping them to improve their overall performance and become more independent as a student.

The performance rate of 90% set for faculty feeling that their student ' learning increased as a result of tutoring was also met. Results indicated that 96.7% and 100% (TLC and HKATC respectfully) of the faculty surveyed felt that their tutoring expectations were met and their students' learning increased as a result of tutoring services. In addition, both TLC and HKATC faculty gave positive ratings on the effectiveness of the tuors and overall services of the Centers.

HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGE ANNUAL UNIT REVIEW TEMPLATE

The expected level of achievement set for tutoring services was "10% increase of student usage of the Centers, especially for high risk students and those enrolled in STEM related classes" has also been met.

The most substantial increase, when compared to the previous academic year, occurred in student usage of both writing (288%) and math (173%) tutoring sessions at HKATC. There was also a significant increase in the number of unduplicated writing (150%) and math (63%) classes as well as a significant increase in the unduplicated number of writing (211%) and math (33%) teachers using tutoring services at HKATC. The increased number of students using HKATC's tutoring services (tutoring started in 2010) is a positive sign that students and faculty are taking advantage of the resources and services available to promote student success, one of ASU's Outcomes.

Data results for TLC writing tutoring indicated a decrease in total number of tutoring sessions (22%), unduplicated number of classes(24%), and unduplicated number of teachers (.08%). Possible reasons for this decrease could be attributed to the drop in enrollment, number and types of classes using TLC, and possibly students using HKATC resources as well as other resources on the upper campus. TLC math tutoring results indicated an increase in total number of sessions (25%), increase in unduplicated number of classes (16%), and increase in unduplicated number of teachers (25%). It was great to see the increase in students and faculty using math tutors and resources for both HKATC and TLC, since they are STEM related fields.

(See Appendix D for Tutoring P-SLOs)

D) Other Comments – Include any information that will clarify the assessment process report.

E) Next Steps – Describe what the unit will do to improve the results.

Implement a tutor mentoring pilot project where two math tutors will be assigned to work with 10 students each for a designated Math ABCD class. These tutors will work four hours a week, each for 16 weeks, assisting students to successfully complete their course.